

Understanding Urban Built form Traditions; Using Methodical Study of Historic Sources

A Case Study of Sindh, Pakistan

Anila Naeem, Ph.D.

Introduction

Since late 19th century efforts are being made to develop systematic methods of research and analysis of the historic past and its link to the present. Outcomes of these debates provide scientific methods of research on built environments and their impact on human development. The major contributions being from two distinct groups of professionals - firstly, the historians and geographers who developed methods of 'urban historical geography' linking history and geography with socio-economics, politics, and other related areas of human history and environment, and secondly, the urban planners and urban designers who developed the methodological approach of 'urban morphology' for studying and understanding the context of built environments and historic urban fabric through an analysis of city plans. Both have their strengths and weaknesses: historians, criticized for their preoccupation with social, economic, religious, cultural and political aspects of a town's history (Gauthiez, 2004); whereas

urban planners/ designers' reprimanded for their emphasis on morphological analysis, ignoring the social aspects (Billinge, 1982). The two approaches initially having evolved rather separately, eventually expanded as interdisciplinary fields combining their strengths to enrich the research outcomes.

Sindh, the south-eastern province of Pakistan is an under-researched area, especially in terms of its historic environments. This research seeks to consolidate the available fragmented information from primary and secondary sources, and review these to gain a holistic understanding on the region's historic built form traditions and urban fabric in reference to their present state. The research methodology involves a literature review of historical sources on Sindh, aiming to put together the existing knowledge on its historic environments, and build on it through updated field data, addressing issues of deficient scientific exploration on Sindh – particularly in defining significance and identities for historic urban places, their regional level mapping and classification of historic towns. The method uses, as a starting point, predefined and well established definitions of towns and urban centers (Carter, 1983; Garnier and Chabot, 1967) and applying these to review Sindh in its historic perspective to short-list towns of historic significance. These were then studied in detail to identify the core factors shaping their traditional built form.

Sindh has a deep rooted history based on ethnic, cultural and linguistic lines, unique to the area, thus seeking definition of its urban historic built form traditions requires consideration of not only tangible observables but also customs, religious beliefs/ practices and socio-cultural norms of society.

Many of Sindh's cities that once served as centers of learning, hubs of trade/ commerce, and seats of administrative power, today suffer a declined existence due to various political, administrative and social changes resulting from Sindh's annexation (1843) by the British and, later, due to the provincially polarized administrative approaches of post-Independence (1947) Pakistan. Their urban fabric, having undergone many changes, continues to suffer major

transformations due to lack of appreciation as valuable historic and cultural national assets, and an absence of political support to promote policies encouraging their conservation.

Damages to historic environments go unchecked, leaving them vulnerable to pressures threatening their existence. There is thus an urgent need to identify important historic towns of the region, build awareness and appreciation for their unique values, and recognize their significance/ potentials through viable in-depth understanding of their typo-morphological patterns and built form traditions.

Urban Historical Geography, Methods of Research and Analysis

Urban historical geography as a field of research helps establish a continuous link of the present with the historic past, giving a sense of permanence and continuity to built environments. Methods of research in this field involve an analysis of built environments in their historic context by using surviving evidences of the past. The objective is to encourage an appreciation and pride in the reminiscences of the historic past by the present society, and promote an approach that seeks to integrate and incorporate historic environments within the present day. Applying methods of historico-geographical research allow interpretations and analysis of human activities over long periods of time, in association with the environment, and its resources, helping build a connection on the basis of changing socio-economic and political trends with the changes in pattern of human behaviour and, thus, the preferential developments in socio-cultural activities, economic and political inclinations and the built form.

Historical geography as a field took shape in the 1920's¹. Debates and exchange of ideas during 1920's and 30's (primarily by French scholars) redefined the historian's role as that of a facilitator

¹ Baker (1984) attributes Lucien Fabvre (Paris, 1922), Carl Sauer (California, 1925), Marc Bloch (Oslo and Paris 1931) and Clifford Darby (Cambridge, 1936) as the four pioneering contributors to be 'viewed contextually as intellectual innovators'.

to locate, accumulate, collate and authenticate documents so that history could be written 'as it really was'. In Britain, however, this change was initiated around mid 70's and experimentation with possibilities to combine disciplines external to geography was attempted (Butlin, 1982). With this broadening of scope an interdisciplinary approach developed, making it possible to induct a wide variety of primary data sources. These, however, have their own set of drawbacks and constraints requiring an understanding of the exact nature of source materia , its original purpose, limitations and context (Baker, 1970).

It is thus important to use a range of different sources to make up for the voids/ weaknesses and allow the possibility for cross-referencing the interpretations.

The range of sources commonly employed for research in historical geography include official documents² (such as tax records, census enumerator's books, crop returns, wills, government statistics), maps of a region or specific cities,³ old photographs/ images,⁴ private archives (such as diaries, correspondence, business accounts, inventories), etc.

Urban Morphology

Urban morphology is defined as the 'study of city forms' (Gauthier, 2006) or the 'study of the city as a human habitat' (Moudon, 1997); a method for studying the built environment using plans as a source of history and geography, and as data for urban

2 Compiled for purposes of government and administration prove useful due to sheer weight of detailed information they contain. Their drawback being a stress on official points of view, while unofficial opinions and perceptions are unrecorded. In addition they overlook topics peripheral to official administration but could be of interest to historical geographers (Hall, 1982).

3 Usually produced through government survey departments; provide valuable information on trade and communication links and directions of growth; in addition containing information on sociological clusters and boundaries reflected by old street/ sector names. Comparison and analysis of topographical, cadastral or survey maps of any region or city prepared at different periods gives a clear view on growth and development patterns (Harley, 1982).

4 Use of images as a source to understand the past is called '**geosophy**'. Its drawback being the fact that researchers tend to disregard actual behaviour of people in the past, reducing geosophical studies to only catalogues of images. Advocated as the most human level of providing a link with past –it must not be kept separate from historical geography; but becomes meaningful only if used with adequate cross referencing from other contemporary sources (Chambers, 1982).

planning. The key concepts in today's urban morphology initially developed during and before 1940's, were made fully explicit during 1950's and early 1960's (Gauthiez, 2004).

Elements of morphological analysis include plot, buildings/ constructed space open space/ gardens/ parks, streets and monuments, considered as having organic qualities that transform through time.

Among urban morphologists there, generally, is a consensus regarding what they study, but considerable debate is generated over how to study the urban forms. Summarizing the philosophical contributions in urban morphology Mugavin (1999) identifies Michel Foucault and Henry Lefebvre as pioneers. Moudon (1997) identifies three main schools of thought in urban morphological research:

- The **Italian (Muratorian) school** primarily focused on study of urban form for prescriptive purposes, with the aim of developing a theory of city design; concentrating on how cities should be built.
- The **Birmingham (Conzenian) school**, dominated by geographers, focuses on the study of urban form for descriptive and explanatory purposes, with the aim of developing a theory of city building, concerned with how cities are built and why.
- The **French school** studied urban form to assess the impact of past design theories on city building, assessing differences or similarities between stated directives about what should be built, and what has actually been built.

Contributions from other origins are also acknowledged but the Italian and British schools are considered as most impactful in developing of distinct approaches, the most important being the understanding of built environment as a system of relations submitted to rules of transformation - further enriched by capturing cultural occurrences as part of the process to better understand their complexity. In 1996, the expansion of urban morphology beyond

its original confines in geography, was officially acknowledged, and its emergence as an interdisciplinary field (Moudon, 1997), initiating establishment of a domain spanning geography, history, archaeology, architecture and planning, hence the humanities, social sciences and professions, study and action, knowledge and decision, description and prescription. It was further broadened to incorporate issues of sustainability, environmental values, socio- economics, as well as aspects of culture, multi-ethnicity and religion. These trends have brought the fields of urban historical geography and urban morphology closer in their objective.

Primary and Secondary Sources on Sindh: Identification and Method for Use in Research

Based on a theoretical framework incorporating methods from historical geography and urban morphology, this research involves extensive use of primary and secondary sources on the case study region of Sindh. The literature review incorporates published historical accounts, historical analysis (20th century and more recent research publications), various observations/ experiences documented through travelogues and books (largely 19th century publications written mostly by European travellers, British political agents and officers deputed in the region, prior to and after Sindh's annexation) and official gazetteers.

Regional Mapping and typo-Morphological Analysis of Sindh's Historic Towns

Historical sources on Sindh indicate that its built environment has been influenced by the physiographic features that historically posed severe challenges to human survival and sustenance, determining the pattern and growth of settlements. Of greatest impact has been the River Indus, whose treacherously unstable nature dominated settlement patterns, up till the 19th and 20th century. Few cities have managed a continuous existence; surviving examples having suffered at the hands of insensitive developments, remain jeopardized by inappropriate planning practices resulting in a loss of their unique fabric. The regional

mapping of Sindh's historic urban centres presented here is an outcome of a systematic analytical process that led to identification of surviving historic towns and determining their value in the historic context, in conjunction with present growth and development patterns.

Sindh: Geographic Position - Physiographical and Topographical Composition

Sindh, Pakistan's second largest province (in terms of population), is spread over an area of 140,914km² (54,407miles²), having a population of 30.44 million as of 1998 census records (GoP, 2009; IUCN, 2007). Located at the far western corner of the Indian Sub-continent, Sindh geographically enjoys a strategic position at the crossroad of cultures. Added to this is the advantage of its River (Indus) flowing across its centre along N-S axis, linking to the sea on the south, connecting it both regionally and globally. This connectivity has been the reason for Sindh's economic prosperity and cultural enrichment, but creating vulnerability to territorial occupation from outside forces, even till present times. Sindh's administrative boundaries are largely defined by natural features of the landscape. The western boundary defined by Kirthar Mountain Ranges, the southwest edge marked by the Arabian Sea, the south having Runn of Kutch, the eastern boundaries adjoin Rajasthan Desert, and the north-east having the plains of Punjab (IUCN, 2007; Sorley, 1959; Thornton, 1844). Sindh is categorized as the 'Lower Indus Basin', but due to the varied physiographic features within, it is divided into four distinct sub-regions: Kirthar Mountain Range (*Kohistan*), Desert Belt (Tharparkar), Alluvial Plains and Indus Delta.

The lifeline of Sindh and its only perennial source of water is the River Indus, originating in Tibet some 1800 miles away from the sea, and flowing through Kashmir, NWFP⁵ and Punjab, and entering Sindh near Kashmor. Within Sindh its length is about 580 miles, and its width varies from 1/3rd to 1 mile, depending on the season and inundation level. Throughout its course in Sindh, the Indus waterway has only two stable portions (at Sukkur and at Kotri

near Hyderabad), remainder being treacherously unstable and unpredictable. This was especially so before extensive embankment activities commissioned by the British. Prior to this the extent and rapidity with which Indus changed its course contributed immensely to the region's history and shaping of its settlement pattern. Before colonial occupation, Indus also served as the major highway, continuing to serve the purpose till late 19th century when development of extensive roads and railways network took over. The British interest in Sindh originated with their desire to use the Indus as an artery of communication - both for commercial and military purposes.

Evolution of Settlement Pattern in Sindh

Roots of Sindh's urbanization are traced back to 7th millennium BC through a plethora of archaeological evidences that prove the existence of a well developed network of urban centres, indicating a predominant settlement pattern having larger towns of more permanent nature with high population density, located along the river, shifting with changes in the river course. In addition, a considerable degree of habitation existed in areas distant from the river but having natural water reservoir or seasonal torrential streams with settlements of a less permanent nature and nomadic population.

Early 6th century BCE marks the beginning of Sindh's recorded history (Hughes, 1876; Pithawala, 1937). The historic periods (dating 6th - 19th century) show a particularly high rate of urbanization, due to the region's privileged position at the cross roads of major maritime and land trade routes (Mariwalla, 1981). Descriptions of Sindh's cities from the 9th - 10th centuries reflect a well developed network of large and small towns, having a nucleus centre - the seat of the ruling authority. Smaller towns served as feeders to the larger system. More detailed accounts of later centuries reflect upon the existence of multi occupational and socially stratified complex urban centers. Up to early 17th century the urbanization process and the rise and decline of cities depended on hydrology and hydraulics. During the 17th century

Sindh was annexed to the Mughal Empire, initiating the irrigation schemes, further enhanced by Kalhora and Talpur rulers during the 18th - 19th centuries, stabilizing cities and settlements. The pattern of settlements and administrative structure, however, remained similar till the mid 19th century when major transformations occurred as a consequence of British annexation of Sindh in 1843.

Sindh's colonization brought with it a period of major transformations: social structure, traditional institutions, landscape, built environment and urban systems, economies, legislative and administrative frameworks - everything ingrained for centuries was put on a new path of 'reformation'; the changes being rather abrupt and often incompatible (Khuhro, 1999). Progressive developments in physical infrastructure opened up a new era of advancement and growth. Improvements in communication links (road network and railways), development of harbor/ port facilities at Karachi and expansion of irrigation systems all over Sindh, provided new opportunities in commerce and trade, creating economic prospects that encouraged migrations from all over the subcontinent, resulting in rapid growth of towns. New towns emerged with creation of new districts and their administrative centres. Urban centres, however, maintained a close link and dependence on their adjoining rural hinterland, as well as towns and cities of Baluchistan, Punjab, NWFP and Rajasthan (Markovits, 2008). For the British, Sindh remained a military outpost, thus large cantonments were also established throughout the region changing the landscape and scale/ character of Sindh's cities.

Another major turning point in Sindh's urban history is the India-Pakistan Partition resulting in mass migrations that completely changed the demography of the province. Mass exodus of Hindus and Sikhs caused a major shift of communities, taking away a population having cultural and emotional associations. This was replaced by an influx of non-Sindhi Muslims having their own strong cultural ideals – detached from the norms of Sindhi culture. A conflict of interests thus developed (Ansari, 2005); Sindhi Muslims struggling to retain the regions' ethnic and linguistic identity, whereas non-Sindhi Muslim migrants fighting to carve out a place for themselves as an emergent community and a political

power in their newly acquired homeland. The post-Independence society of Sindh thus has complexities of ethnicity, power, religion and language. Its urban centres, mainly Karachi, Hyderabad and Sukkur, are strongholds of Urdu speaking immigrant *Mohajirs*, the provincial political power, however, remains with the agrarian elite or Sindhi *waderos*, having large land holdings and unquestioned influence on Sindhi middle class majority.

The pre-Partition urbanization process in Sindh was planned and well organized, but mass migrations during the first decade after Partition resulted in rapid urbanization of unprecedented scale and magnitude. Sindh was profoundly affected because of its limited natural resources, added to which was the drastic cut in its revenues due to Karachi being taken over by the central government as the capital. Conflicts in political structure and an increasing polarity with the centre have left the province in a crisis that remains unresolved.

Sindh's Historic Towns of Significance

The identification of important historic towns of Sindh, and attempting their typo-morphological analysis is carried out in a two stepped process; the first stage incorporates short-listing of important historic towns from a list of Sindh's cities having a population >20,000. The second stage involves detailed study of ten shortlisted cases. This two staged analysis indicates four key parameters (function, topography, geographical importance and period contributions) as the main contributing factors shaping the historic built environments in the region. These factors are briefly explained as follows:

Function: Through well established definitions two main factors - size and function - are identified as the most important determinants of urbanization and designation of town status. These were taken as the starting point of research; the aspect of size dealt through information from census records, and that of historic functions was identified through a literature review on urban centres combined with Sindh's urban history.

A tabulation of Sindh's cities (Table 1) for identified historic functions indicates that all urban centres of present times are tied with one common factor, their link with the modern communications network - the railways and highways. The table also indicates that cities with a population of >100,000, in addition to being well connected also served either as district headquarters or important British cantonments, meaning that historic towns grew only when given administrative or military importance. Among cities being associated with historic functions, presently seven have a population >50,000; others come within the range of medium and smaller cities. Sifting through this information on size of towns and their historically important functions, fifteen surviving urban centres emerge as towns of significant historical value that contributed to urban traditions in the region - specific function/s or value of significance for each identified town is also indicated. In order of highest number of historic pre-colonial functions these include: **Thatta** (seven functions), **Hyderabad** and **Sukkur** (six functions), **Karachi** (five functions), **Rohri**, **Mirpurkhas** and **Sehwan** (four functions), **Hala** and **Shikarpur** (three functions), **Jacobabad**, **Kotdiji** and **Khairpur** (two functions) and **Umerkot**, **Jhimpir**, **Jherruk** (one function)

To develop a typo-morphological classification, ten cases from the above shortlisted cases were studied in detail. The process included developing a historic profile for each case, in conjunction with close examination of maps to analyse the morphological development and growth pattern of the built form. The analysis helped identify three further contributing parameters shaping the built environment. Following is a brief explanation on these:

Topography: In Sindh the choice for location of towns was from the viewpoint of defense as well as the possibilities for agriculture, trade and settlement. The four types of locations used are: firstly, the hilly terrain providing the possibility of natural defenses, either set within the central alluvial region (Sukkur, Hyderabad, Thatta) or on the periphery of the arid zone (Kotdiji); secondly, the flat alluvial plains within the zone covered by natural inundation of the Indus (Khairpur, Shikarpur, Jacobabad); thirdly,

the plains of the arid zone located on the periphery and fed by the outreach canals (Mirpurkhas, Umerkot); and lastly, the deltaic plains along the mouths of the Indus (Karachi).

Geographical importance: The main indicators for this aspect are existing communication links - the railways, highways and regional road network. Link to railways was an important factor of growth or otherwise, of cities during the 20th century. Towns not connected to it (Thatta, Umerkot, Kotdiji) show little or practically no economic growth. In Sindh, development of an extensive highways network with modern standards is a more recent phenomenon (1990s); prior to this, intercity road links merged into the local road network. The major national highway along N-S axis bypasses most cities on their periphery, except for Karachi which serves as a terminus of all highways. Other cities through which the highway runs (Jacobabad, Mirpurkhas, Umerkot) do not lie directly on the main N-S grid, thus having less traffic pressure, and still functioning with older intercity roads. The last indicator of geographic importance is the pattern of regional roads. Cities lying on the regional and sub-regional cross roads (Shikarpur, Mirpurkhas) have a radial pattern, with intercity roads from different directions, resulting in a concentric growth pattern. Other cities have a more linear road network, dictated either by topographical constraints or by their geographic location on a linear communication grid.

Period contributions: Based on an understanding of the regional history three primary sub-groups are defined - pre-colonial, colonial and post-independence periods. The pre-colonial period has further distinguishable subdivisions within, representing dynastic periods that contributed in various developments. But due to a lack of research based information they are grouped together, and their detailed parameters developed on the basis of a brief analysis of the fabric of case study towns. For colonial and post-Independence periods a better understanding of built form is achieved through existing literature and published sources. However, the exact extent, magnitude and impact of even these on specific towns, can only be gained through detailed documentation of existing built fabric.

The four identified key parameters tabulated (Table 4) for the ten case studies indicate a diverse variety, each town having a different set of elements or factors contributing to the development of its urban form. It thus seems appropriate to suggest that instead of attempting a standard pre-defined typological classification of towns, a better suited approach would be to follow an inductive process that allows incorporation of the diversity and variety existing within the region. If all contributing identified factors are taken into consideration it is unlikely to achieve a standardized typology; but these four key parameters can be a binding factor for any typo-morphological analysis, on basis of which commonalities in growth patterns or morphological forms or dissimilarities and uniqueness, for specific cases can be recognized (Naeem, 2009).

An Overview and Conclusions

Sindh indicates a pattern of settlements historically prone to the vagaries of nature. Even more permanent places could not survive the destructive effects of hydrology or that of abandonment due to shift of population. The entire region is thus filled with archaeological sites left as evidences of lost cities and urban centres, only a few historic towns managing to survive till present times. The historic timeline of Sindh indicates the oldest surviving cities being those placed at stable locations of the Indus; i.e. Sukkur-Bukkur-Rohri, Sehwan, Hala and Hyderabad (first two being strategic island fortifications). From the 14th century, local Dynasties were established in Sindh, bringing in more stability and prosperity to the region. But the singular element of primary significance up till the mid 19th century remained the River Indus - the highway of communications, thus the main contributor to economic prosperity and urban growth. Between 14th – 17th centuries settlements concentrated along the main river channel, and the concept of a large capital town emerged (Thatta being the earliest example was a hub of all activities, fed in by a system of smaller supportive towns having specific crafts or agriculture based expertise). In addition, regional boundaries were guarded by fortified locations at strategic entry points from neighbouring lands; examples being Ranikot, Umarkot, Manora (Bukkur and Sehwan continuing to

serve as central strongholds). Some border forts developed into small cities during 19th - 20th century (Kotdiji and Umerkot), whereas others lost their significance surviving today as abandoned ruins (Ranikot). By 18th century a degree of control over natural resources gained through introduction of canal irrigation practices, further expanded the sphere of settled areas. Hyderabad superseded Thatta as the 18th century capital. Establishment of Talpur Dynasty towards the end of this century, brought with it a newer concept of decentralized and multi-centred form of administration with three capital towns (Hyderabad, Khairpur, Mirpurkhas) and two main centres of trade and commerce (Karachi and Shikarpur). The scale of cities, the pattern of their settlements and the administrative systems up till these times, however, remained very similar. Mid-19th century colonization of Sindh brought a change in administrative pattern and scale of developments. Growth and economic prosperity of towns became tied to communication links and mode of transportation revolutionized during this period. The 20th century's legacy of industrialization and capitalization has also contributed in shaping the built environment, but their impact in Sindh remains concentrated in and around Karachi resulting in an overexploitation of its natural resources, adversely affecting the region's ecosystem.

The strategic geographic location of Sindh – serving as an entry point into the Sub-continent - played an important role in the development of cultural and political trends. The winds of change brought with them different representations; new expressions in built form were adopted, previous traditions were sometimes ignored, but, mostly, finding a niche within. Although much of the built environment has undergone radical changes at different times, there still remains substantial evidence that enables us to read the multilayered historic traditions of the region.

The regional level mapping of Sindh's urban centres, presented here, provides a comprehensive picture of its urbanization pattern, helps identify key factors contributing to the process, and defines characteristics of significance for surviving historic places. By consolidating existing information, a holistic regional perspective

is developed that accentuates the importance of different factors as determinants of the typo-morphological form of cities. The regional map helps reinstate the significance of historic towns that no longer hold importance in today's economy and development trends (eg. Thatta and Umerkot), thus re-affirming their place as important historic centres and national heritage assets. The analytical process points towards a need for detailed documentation of identified historic towns, acknowledging each case as having a degree of uniqueness. In addition, the inclusion of archaeological sites in the regional mapping process emphasizes their importance in development of urban traditions, giving a comprehensive picture of settlement patterns that evolved over centuries, in Sindh. These historic towns are thus an invaluable resource for which there is an urgent need to seek a niche within present development plans, ensuring protection of their inherent values. This analytical research primarily contributes towards developing recognition for concepts of urban/ historic town conservation as the required professional approach; giving a frame of reference for linking planning policies and development processes visualized at a regional level; advocating for strategies geared towards recognition and protection of historic environments.

T. 1

Evaluation for determining significance in terms of contributing historic functions of cities in Sindh (all towns having population of >20,000 inhabitants are taken into consideration).

Centre of Traditional Crafts and Industry	Archaeological Importance	Religious Center (Shrine/ Pilgrimage Place)	Administrative Center			Defence/ Military Importance			Important Nodes of Trade or Transit				Cities of Sindh	1998v Census Figures	
			District Headquarter	Prov./ National Capital	Native Rulers' Capital	Walled City	Fort	British Cantonment	Caravan Route	River Port	Sea Port	Railway			Highways/ Roads
◆	◆		●			◆	◆	●	◆		◆	●	●	Karachi	92,04,480
◆	◆		●	●	◆	◆	◆	●		◆		●	●	Hyderabad	11,66,894
◆	◆	◆	●		◆	◆	●		◆			●	●	Sukkur/ Bukkur	3,35,551
			●									●	●	Larkana	2,70,283
◆	◆		●		◆	◆						●	●	Mirpurkhas	1,89,671
			●				◆	●	◆			●	●	Nawabshah	1,89,244
			●			◆	◆	●	◆			●	●	Jacobabad	1,38,780
			●				◆	●				●	●	Shikarpoor	1,34,883
◆			●		◆							●	●	Khairpur	1,05,637
												●	●	Tando Adam	103,363
			●									●	●	Dadu	1,02,550
												●	●	Tando Allahyar	86,056
												●	●	Khandhkot	66,727
			●									●	●	Tando M. Khan	62,087
												●	●	Badin	61,302
												●	●	Kotri	61,130
												●	●	Shahdadkot	59,836
												●	●	Moro	59,321
												●	●	Shahdadpur	58,802
												●	●	Qambar	57,230
												●	●	Ghotki	51,401
												●	●	Sanghar	50,259
◆	◆	◆								◆		●	●	Rohri	44,143
◆	◆	◆										●	●	Hala	39,926
◆	◆		●		◆	◆			◆	◆	◆	●	●	Thatta	36,915
			●			◆						●	●	Umerkot	35,059
	◆	◆			◆	◆						●	●	Sehwan	34,289
	◆					◆						●	●	Koldiji	21,345
	◆											●	●	Jherruk	
	◆											●	●	Jhimpir	